REWRITING THE STORY: TACKLING MEDIA GENDER STEREOTYPES IN POLITICAL AND PUBLIC LIFE

Training of trainers toolkit





Funded by the European Union. Views and opinions expressed are however those of the author(s) only and do not necessarily reflect those of the European Union or the European Commission. Neither the European Union nor the granting authority can be held responsible for them.

Acknowledgements

Publisher: International Federation of Journalists (IFJ)

Managing Editor: Pamela Morinière (IFJ)

Editor: Jeremy Dear (IFJ)

Author: Marie Palmer

Design: Jada Pontello, Valentine Gelcys (IFJ)

Contributions from: Elena Chiaberge (COPEAM), Claudia Padovani (University of Padova), Nisrine Salameh (IFJ) Lucia Vázquez

(Complutense University of Madrid)

Copyright: IFJ 2023

The content of this toolkit can be freely reproduced as long as all extracts mention "Rewriting the story" as the source of the extract.



Introductory words

In The International Encyclopedia of Gender, Media, and Communication, Ross (2020) [1] draws pessimistic conclusions on the place of women in the media

"Research has consistently demonstrated that women are represented, covered, and reported on in ways that are different to men, often stereotypical and limited to a narrow range of topics and perspectives. This holds true even for elite women such as politicians and even for women who hold the most senior political office in any country, as prime minister, president, or chancellor (Trimble, 2014). Not only are there problems of content, orientation, and tone when women politicians do feature in news media, but their marginalization, at least in relation to their actual numbers as formally elected representatives, is the other significant (and problematic) aspect of the women-politics-news nexus."

Such a conclusion confirms her previous observation: "a woman politician is always described as a woman politician in the media, her sex is always on display, always the primary descriptor. She is defined by what she is not, that is, she is not a 'typical' politician [...]"[2]. Gender then becomes "at root a status inequality" for female politicians (Ridgeway, 2011)[3]. It affects the perception of their agency, competencies and efficiency due to deeply ingrained cultural beliefs (Fiske et al., 2002)[4], and finally impacts voting behaviour (Sanbonmatsu 2002)[5], with male candidates being perceived as more electable than women (Leeper, 1991) [6].

^[1] Ross, K. (2020). Political Communication: General. In K. Ross, I. Bachmann, V. Cardo, S. Moorti and M. Scarcelli (eds). *The International Encyclopedia of Gender, Media, and Communication*. Wiley Blackwell.

^[2] Ross, K. (2004). The Gendered Turn in Mediated Politics. In K. Ross and C. M. Byerly (eds.), Women and Media: International Perspective, Malden: Blackwell Publishing Ltd, pp. 60-80

^[3] Ridgeway Cecilia L. 2011. Framed by Gender. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.

^[4] Fiske, S. T., Cuddy, A. J., Glick, P., Xu, J. (2002). A Model of (Often Mixed) Stereotype Content: Competence and Warmth Respectively Follow From Perceived Status and Competition. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 82(6), pp. 878–902

^[5] Sanbonmatsu, K. (2002). Political Parties and the Recruitment of Women to State Legislatures. *Journal of Politics*. 64(3), pp. 791-809.

^[6] Leeper, M. S. (1991). The impact of prejudice on female candidates: An experimental look at voter inference. *American Politics Quarterly*, 18, pp. 248-61.

Gender inequalities in media representation are visible on various levels. Women politicians, either cisgender or transgender, are less visible in the media than their male counterparts (Ross & Sreberny 2000) [7]. Even when visible in the media, they tend to be represented in a stereotypical way (Childs, 2008) [8]. The media focus on style and personal life rather than on their political action and competences. Research shows that news media are more likely to mention characteristics such as gender, marital status, parental status, age, personality, and appearance for female politicians than for males (Bystrom et al., 2001; Banwart et al., 2003) [9]. Such stereotypes are reinforced by other intersectional factors such as ethnicity and socio-economic background (Fiig, 2010) [10].

In promoting gender stereotypes, the media condemn a majority of the world population to play a lesser role in public life. As such, they weaken democracy and undermine human rights. Instead, media companies could use their symbolic power to redefine the role of cisgender and transgender women in society and to provide them the place they deserve. However, despite the increasing awareness regarding gender inequalities, the unequal media dynamic hasn't really changed since the landmark <u>Beijing Platform for Action</u>. The perdurability of gender stereotypes in the media is baffling. Neither the increasing number of women in newsrooms, nor the growing number of cis and trans female leaders over the years, have inverted the dynamic.

^[7] Ross, K., & Sreberny, A. (2000). Women in the house: Media representation of British politicians, in: A. Sreberny and L. van Zoonen (eds.): *Gender, politics and communication*. Hampton Press Inc., Cresskill, NJ.

^[8] Childs, S. (2008). Women and British Party Politics. Descriptive, substantive and symbolic representation. Routledge, London

^[9]Bystrom, D., Robertson T., Banwart, M. (2001). Framing the fight: An analysis of media coverage of female and male candidates in primary races for governor and U.S. Senate in 2000. *American Behavioral Scientist*. 44, pp. 1999-2013. Banwart, M., Bystrom, D., Robertson, T. (2003). From the primary to the general: A comparative analysis of candidate media coverage in mixed-gender 2000 races for governor and U.S. Senate. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 46, pp. 658-676. [10] Fiig, C. (2010). Media Representation of women politicians from a gender to an intersectionality perspective. Kvinder, Køn og forskning, 2010(2-3), 41-49. http://koensforskning.soc.ku.dk/kkf/tidligere_numre/2010/2_3/

News media still have a long way to go to represent cis and transgender female leadership in an adequately gender-balanced manner; and every single effort counts. Rewriting the story is intended to help journalists understand the many aspects that gender equality encompasses and how to reduce existing inequalities. The three main goals of this training programme are:

- Enhancing journalists' understanding of gender biases in the media representation of female politicians and women in public life;
- Raising awareness regarding the use of gender stereotypes in their daily professional routines;
- Providing adequate tools to eliminate gender stereotypes at each stage of the news production process.

Please note that every time the words woman/man or female/male are used in this document, it systematically includes both cisgenders and transgenders. The author voluntarily chose to avoid mentioning it every time these words were used in order to show that women/men can either be cisgender or transgender, and there is no point in considering these words as culturally unmarked as cisgender. However, cisgenders and transgenders were differentiated, when the training requested a specific emphasis on differences between cisgender and transgender people.

Structure of the toolkit

The Rewriting the story - Training of trainers (ToT) toolkit provides material and guidance to trainers for the organisation of future training sessions. It is divided into modules, each of them sub-divided into three learning targets to achieve (except Module 6). The series of modules is broken down in a chronological order to fight gender biases at each stage of the news production process. Module 1 highlights the striking dissonance between the actual place of women in politics and their gender-stereotyped representation in the media. Modules 2 to 5 provide tools to track and eliminate gender stereotypes at each stage of the production of a news story. Finally, Module 6 emphasises the pedagogical aspects to take into account when training journalists.

Module 1 - From denier to confronter - Understanding the importance of gender equality in the media.

This module aims to turn participants into advocates of gender equality in the media, by showing the existing dissonance between the position occupied by women in politics in European countries and their representation in the media. It also focuses on defining gender equality in the context of media representation.

Teaching goals:

- Raise awareness of the representation of women in politics
- Elaborate a comprehensive definition of gender equality in the news
- · List the different factors that impact gender equality in the media

Module 2 - Selecting a news story: Towards a gender positive newsworthiness

Selecting a news story: Towards a gender positive newsworthiness focuses on how to avoid gender biases when selecting a news story and how to foster gender equality in media representation of politicians through gender positive newsworthiness.

Teaching goals:

- Elaborate a comprehensive definition of gender equal newsworthiness
- Identify some stereotypical topics considered as newsworthy when portraying women
- Understand the importance of applying the "rule of reversibility" when selecting some editorial content or when conducting an interview

Module 3 - Choosing a gender neutral frame

Choosing a gender neutral frame sheds light on the power of framing, which is the selection of a specific narrative for a given news story. Some frames are more likely to be chosen to describe female politicians than their male counterparts, creating important gender inequalities in reporting politicians.

Teaching goals:

- Uncover and analyse frames contained in news stories
- Understand the 'double bind' dilemma created by a cisgender masculine framing of leadership
- Eliminate gendered frames from your news stories.

Module 4 - News writing: Fighting gender-biased reporting automatisms

News writing: Fighting gender-biased writing automatisms scrutinises the power of language choices when composing a news story. Language, as a social construction, carries suggested meaning that may trigger gender biases.

Teaching goals:

- Detect subtle forms of gendered discourse often hidden in a news story using Critical Discourse Analysis
- Debunk one's gendered writing automatisms
- Replace deeply ingrained gendered writing habits by genderneutral writing habits

Module 5 - Choose your illustration: Gender-balanced multimodality and visual semiotics

Choose your illustration: Gender-balanced multimodality and visual semiotics focuses on the existence of gender biases in visuals and in multimodal compositions, such as social media news snippets. It provides some tools to interpret visual messages and avoid gender biases in the selection of illustrative pictures or composition of a tweet.

Teaching goals:

- Understand the rules of visual design and multimodal composition in news photographs
- Eliminate gender biases from video broadcasting
- Understand the specificities of tweets and other social media platforms news snippets

Module 6 - Methodology - Getting ready to be a trainer

Methodology - Getting ready to be a trainer wraps up the Rewriting the story- Training of trainers session. This module aims at reasserting the pedagogical goals at each step of the training and answering all the questions future trainers might have. It anticipates possible contingencies that trainers may have to face when running training in their countries. At the end of this session, future trainers should be confident to run the training in their country.

Each module, is divided as follows:

- An introduction that sets three main pedagogical targets and provides a detailed definition of the main concepts to be studied in the module;
- Three parts, one per pedagogical target, composed of a theoretical explanation, a list of suggested exercises that can be translated and adapted for the national training workshops, including tips and questions to stimulate debate after the exercises, and a list of useful resources.

The resource list for each module contains several types of resources:

- Institutional resources, including reports from organisations focusing on gender equality;
- Academic references that are relevant to the topic;
- Student projects, made by the students of the University of Padova under the supervision of Associate Professor in Political Science and International Relations Claudia Padovani. These projects propose an original approach to topics linked to each module, with practical case studies providing useful examples that can be reused in training;
- Related Advancing Gender Equality in Media Industries (AGEMI) training which consists of a set of learning resources focusing on different aspects of the gender-media-equality relationship. These are all openly accessible on the <u>Advancing Gender Equality in Media Industries course</u> page, after <u>signing up</u> for free.
- Other resources, including news articles.

In addition to the resources listed in the ToT, trainers can search for additional sources in the <u>AGEMI Resources Bank of Good practices</u> which gathers together gender equality initiatives conducted all over the world. The AGEMI Resources Bank of Good practices is extremely useful to help find some local initiatives related to gender equality in the media. It can be searched through semantic filters, thematic filters or an interactive map.

How to get the best out of the Rewriting the story ToT toolkit

To raise participants' awareness regarding their own role in tackling media gender stereotypes in political and public life, some of the exercises were conceived as an analysis of their own journalistic practices. Therefore, it is recommended to request participants to attend the training with a portfolio composed of:

- 15 news stories mentioning cis or trans female politicians
- 5 interviews dedicated to cis or trans female politicians
- Stories mentioning politicians from a minority background
- 10 news stories mentioning a cis or trans male politician
- Stories containing visuals of cis or trans female politicians and of cis or trans male politicians

The participants would preferably work on news stories they authored. The composition of the portfolio can evolve depending on the political specificities of the country. Trainers could decide to focus on selected political figures.

For radio and TV journalists, a transcription of the script would be welcome, in addition to the images. This material will be used for practical exercises during the modules.

TRAINING MODULES

Key concepts: gender equality, patriarchy, gender, sex, cisgender/transgender/non-binary

As Sarah Macharia, coordinator of the Global Media Monitoring Project declares: "One cannot advocate for an issue they don't understand" [12]. Therefore, this module provides participants with a solid definition of gender equality, as a first necessary step to becoming a gender equality advocate.

Journalists can be divided into three mains categories:

- Deniers For deniers, women are represented in a fair and proportional manner in the news. They tend to hide behind their own work and a few examples showing good, or at least acceptable, representation of women in the media.
- Bystanders Contrary to deniers, bystanders perceive that the representation of female politicians in the media is not gender equal and could be improved. However, they don't necessarily feel concerned by this problem on an individual level, mostly because their understanding of the problem is limited or because they don't know how to act to bring about change.
- Confronters Confronters consider that things can be done differently. They tend to be proactive and confront issues. However, they don't necessarily have the adequate tools to confront the existing representation problems.

This first module aims at getting everybody on the same page: deniers, bystanders and confronters. On the one hand, providing evidence of the inequalities in media portrayal of female politicians is likely to soften deniers and to transform them into bystanders. On the other hand, providing a comprehensive definition of gender equality is likely to highlight the role of journalists in the media's portrayal to turn bystanders into possible confronters. Confronters will also complete their understanding of gender equality. As such, Module 1 is a necessary introduction to the next modules, which will provide participants with tools and techniques to do things differently and to improve the portrayal of female politicians in the media. The aim of this module is to shift participants from thinking "things should be different" to wondering "what, as a journalist, can I do differently to avoid gender biases?".

Module targets:

This first module aims at:

- 1/ Raising awareness on the representation of women in politics
- 2/ Elaborating a comprehensive definition of gender equality in the news
- 3/ Understanding the different factors that impact gender equality in the media

Reaching target 1 - Raise awareness regarding the representation of women in politics

Women in Politics vs. female politicians in the news

According to the Global Media Monitoring Project 2020 (GMMP 2020) [13]:

 Women represent only 18% of the government, politician, minister, or spokesperson interviewees in the news. This percentage has increased by 6% since 2000.

- Women are still more likely to appear in unexceptional roles as personal experience providers (42% in traditional media, 41% in news websites) and popular opinion givers (38% in traditional media, 39% in news websites).
- Women's marginalisation in the media is reinforced by their intersectional identities of gender, race, ability, and legal status. For example, a selected sample of news stories showed that ethnic minorities, racialized groups, persons of colour and religious minorities represented just 7% of the subjects and sources[14]. Within this sample, only 28% of the subjects and sources were women.
- Only 3% of all women in the news are aged between 65-79, compared to 15% of the men.

The statistics are unanimous. Women politicians are underrepresented in news and current affairs. The situation is even worse for women from minority groups. Deniers often justify the underrepresentation of women politicians in the news by saying that they are less present in politics. However, this is largely untrue. Women are represented in politics as the following statistics show:

- Worldwide, women represent on average 25.6% of the members elected in parliaments (lower and upper houses included when applicable), 30.4 % in Europe, and 44.5% in Nordic countries[15] (2021).
- Women's representation in local government positions varies from 1% to 67%, with an average of 34% (2022).[16]
- 85 countries have introduced legislative gender quotas for local elections (2022).[17]

Is the representation of women politicians in news and current affairs proportional to the representation of women in politics in your country?

Suggested exercise

Women in the political landscape: perception vs. reality

Individual reflection. Participants are asked to guess/estimate the following elements (the elements can be adapted depending on the administrative organisation of the country):

- % of women in the government;
- % of women in the national parliament;
- % of women in the European Parliament (if applicable);
- % of women head of main political parties;
- % of women at local political level;
- The existence of gender equality legal frameworks in politics;
- How their country is performing in terms of gender equality in comparison to other European countries.

Tips for trainers when reporting the findings

Compare who, among the participants, has the clearest or closest perception of the place of women in the political landscape.

Tips:

- A spatial visualisation in the room can be used to materialise differences of perceptions between the participants.
- Make participants look for the right information. Do they know how to get such information? Provide sources

Further reflection. Focus on the following points:

- Which factors are likely to affect the perception of the representation of women in the political landscape?
- Discuss differences between the perception of the representation of women politicians at the different levels of administration;
- Journalists and programme-makers often say that it is difficult to find female participants, and to persuade them to appear on television. Do these statistics confirm this?

Useful resources

Institutional sources

International Parliamentary Union - Representation of women in national parliaments.

https://data.ipu.org/women-ranking?month=12&year=2022

UN Women - Representation of women in local politics

https://localgov.unwomen.org/

International Parliamentary Union - General data on women in politics

https://www.ipu.org/women-in-politics-2021

EIGE - Women in politics in the EU

https://eige.europa.eu/gender-

statistics/dgs/browse/wmidm/wmidm_pol

The Global Media Monitoring Project 2020 (GMMP2020) - Who makes the news? https://whomakesthenews.org/gmmp-2020-final-reports/

Council of Europe- Media, Gender and Elections- study on media coverage of elections with a specific focus on gender equality https://edoc.coe.int/en/media/7612-media-elections-and-gender-study-on-media-coverage-of-elections-with-a-specific-focus-on-gender-quality.html

Academic sources

van der Pas, D. J. (2022). Do European media ignore female politicians? A comparative analysis of MP visibility. West European Politics, 45(7), 1481–1492.

van der Pas, D.J. & Aaldering, L. (2020). Gender differences in political media coverage: A Meta-Analysis. *Journal of Communication*, 70,(1), 114–143,

Haraldsson, A. & Wängnerud, L. (2019). The effect of media sexism on women's political ambition: evidence from a worldwide study. *Book Feminist Media Studies*, 19(4), 525-541.

Students' work

• Rewriting the story's country profiles describing women's representation in national politics

Reaching Target 2 - Elaborate a comprehensive definition of gender equality in the news

According to the European Institute for Gender Equality (EIGE), gender equality "refers to the equal rights, responsibilities and opportunities of women and men and girls and boys. Equality does not mean that women and men will become the same but that women's and men's rights, responsibilities and opportunities will not depend on whether they are born male or female. Gender equality implies that the interests, needs and priorities of both women and men are taken into consideration, recognizing the diversity of different groups of women and men. Gender equality is not a women's issue but should concern and fully engage men as well as women. Equality between women and men is seen both as a human rights issue and as a precondition for, and indicator of, sustainable people-centred development."[18]

In this context, it is crucial to define gender and to differentiate gender from sex. While sex refers to biology (somebody is biologically male or female, or both), gender is a socially constructed term, which is operationalised in order to prescribe how men and women are expected to behave in society. Gender expectations constantly evolve depending on the socio-cultural context. For the majority of people, their gender identity aligns with the biological sex they were assigned at birth. In this case, we can speak of cisgender individuals. It is important to specify that cisgender relates to gender, not to sexuality. However, when the gender identity they associate with does not align with their biological sex at birth, we can speak of transgender. Some people can be gender-fluid (non binary), meaning having a gender identity that includes both masculinity and femininity, or agender, meaning without any gender identity or gender neutral. Any kind of gender is entitled to gender equality.

What about gender equality in terms of media representation of politicians? Defining gender equality in media representation of politicians aims at understanding what an equal treatment for women and/or other genders, and men politicians would be. It includes equality from a quantitative point of view (proportional representation in the media) and from a qualitative point of view (non stereotypical representation). What does gender equality in the media mean for you?

Suggested exercise

Providing a grassroots definition of gender equality

Small group brainstorming. Participants will discuss in group(s) the following points:

- What is gender equality?
- Why does gender equality in the media matter?
- What does gender equality mean in terms of media representation of female politicians?

Tips for trainers when reporting the findings

- Focus on quantitative and qualitative aspect of gender equality.
- Focus on gender, including the difference between gender and biological sex. Include the difference between cisgender, transgender, agender, non-binary.
- Focus on other factors that impact equal representation and discuss the definition of intersectionality.
- From a very large definition of gender equality, guide the discussion towards gender equality in the media to introduce the second exercise.
- Focus on violence as a factor of gender inequality.

Useful resources

Institutional resources

EIGE Glossary - https://eige.europa.eu/gender-

mainstreaming/concepts-and-definitions

UNWomen Gender equality glossary -

https://trainingcentre.unwomen.org/mod/glossary/view.php?id=36

UNESCO Gender-sensitive indicators for media: framework of indicators to gauge gender sensitivity in media operations and content- https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000217831

WAN-IFRA (2020). Amplifying women's voices. A gender balance guide for media.

https://womeninnews.org/ckfinder/userfiles/files/Gender%20Balance%20Guidebook_FINAL_RGB%20(1).pdf

Council of Europe (2016). Combating gender stereotyping and sexism in the media

https://rm.coe.int/CoERMPublicCommonSearchServices/DisplayDCT MContent?documentId=090000168064379b

AGEMI training

- Unit 2 <u>Issues in gender, representation and news</u> When we think about the relationship between gender and media, one of the most popular ways in which it has been discussed is through an exploration of the media's representation of women in comparison to men, so issues of such differential representation is the primary focus of this unit. We look at the research which has been undertaken on this topic, considering why we get what we get and the various strategies which have been employed to challenge the stereotypes and change the picture.
- Unit 5 <u>Violence against women journalists</u> We have recently witnessed a significant escalation of violence against women, including women media workers, both online and offline, as identified by campaigns such as #metoo and #timesup, and there have been persistent demands by media unions such as the International Federation of Journalists to challenge what many consider to be the unparalleled impunity to target women journalists for simply doing their job.

This unit explores some of the issues which contribute to this abusive environment, as well as detailing the ways in which women journalists, media unions and NGOs are fighting back, including through the development of policies, guidelines and training. Although there are no separate GEMTalks in this unit, there are embedded interviews with women journalists in each of the mini-lectures, all of which can also be accessed via the GEMTalks tab from the main menu.

• Unit 7 - <u>Gender + Intersectionality in the media</u> - The ways in which gender is always inscribed with all the other aspects of ourselves is often overlooked, so in this unit we consider how we never are 'just' our sex, our gender is always changeable and, accepting that gender itself is a social construct, this unit asks us to think about the relationship between sex and gender and consider how the various other aspects of our unique selves, our abilities, our race and ethnic background, our age, our class, all contribute to our sense of identity and will come to the fore in particular circumstances, at particular times.

Related students' project/s

• <u>Women leaders' voices against racial discrimination</u>. This project focuses on racial discrimination and how some key public figures fight against it in different regions of the world: Holocaust survivor and senator for life Liliana Segre (Italy), active feminist, human rights activist and journalist Chaima Lashini (Morocco) and a leader of Tibetan women's federation Ngapoi Cedain Zhoigar (China).

Further readings

- The Guardian (12 Apr. 2016). The dark side of Guardian comments
 As part of a series on the rising global phenomenon of online
 harassment, the Guardian commissioned research into the 70m
 comments left on its site since 2006 and discovered that of the 10
 most abused writers, eight are women, and the two men are black.
 https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2016/apr/12/the-dark-side-of-guardian-comments
- The Guardian (22 Jan. 2013). Mary Beard suffers 'truly vile' online abuse after Question Time https://www.theguardian.com/media/2013/jan/21/mary-beard-suffers-twitter-abuse

Reaching target 3 - List the different factors that impact gender equality in the media

As defined by the World Bank (2011)[19], gender inequality refers to the unequal access to resources, opportunities and capabilities for some individuals, based on their gender. In the media, gender inequalities are highly visible. Women have been "symbolically annihilated" through non-coverage or ambivalent coverage that trivialises their actions[20]. Their symbolic annihilation over time is perpetuated by cultural practices and institutions, which are reflected in people's attitudes, decisions, behaviours and choices (Waylen, 2019)[21]. Among cultural practices that led to the symbolic annihilation of women in the news, can be included the limited number of female journalists in the newsrooms (Pederson et al., 2003)[22].

Suggested exercise - Finding solutions

Small group brainstorming. After defining gender equality, participants will brainstorm on how to improve gender equality in political reporting:

- at international/national level (e.g. government, regulatory bodies, trade unions)?
- at an organisation level?
- at an individual level?

Tips for trainers when reporting the findings

It is important to highlight that gender equality can be achieved only if all the actors are taking a step forward. Focus on what is important:

• On the international/national level: gender equality legal/regulatory frameworks, policies, gender equality agenda.

^[19] World Bank. (2011). World Development Report 2012: Gender Equality and Development. In *World Development Report* 2012. The World Bank.

^[20] Gaye Tuchman (1978), "Introduction: The symbolic annihilation of women by the mass media," in Gaye Tuchman Arlene Kaplan Daniels, and James Benet (eds). Hearth and home: Images of women in the Mass Media.NY Oxford University Press, [21] Waylen, G. (2019). Gendering Institutional Change. In *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Politics* (Issue June, pp. 1–24). [22] Pederson, P., Whisenant, W., & Schneider, R. (2003), Using a content analysis to examine the gendering of sports newspaper personnel and their coverage. *Journal of sports management*, 17, 376-93.

- On the organisational level: what about code of ethics, work conventions/policies to foster gender equality at decision-making level and in working conditions, as well as ethical codes to promote gender equality in media content.
- On an individual level: question individual behaviours. What factors can influence individual behaviours? How can the national/ organisational context influence individual behaviours?
- The existence of databases of female experts all over the world (see for example the <u>Internews list of databases</u> or <u>ENWE</u>).

Useful resources

AGEMI training

- Unit 4 Gendered journalism cultures The ways in which newsroom and journalism cultures are gendered is the focus of this unit. The ways in which gender influences journalistic practice has been researched over several decades and we consider the impact of gendered journalism, how women and men experience the gendered newsroom and why inequalities persist despite the growing number of women entering the profession. In the final section, we consider the strategies which have been developed to challenge gender-based stereotyping, by women themselves, journalism unions and parts of the media industry, and new initiatives which are making a difference. Although there are no separate GEMTalks in this unit, there are embedded interviews with journalists and academics in each of the mini-lectures. Useful resources and readings are included at the end of the unit.
- Unit 5 <u>Women and leadership in media industries</u> One of the key issues in relation to gender and media is the question of women's leadership within media industries and how more women in decision-making positions could change the ways in which women and men are represented and indeed change the picture in more fundamental ways.

This unit encompasses the research that has focused on the factors inhibiting women's career ambitions and considers the strategies which have been developed by a variety of stakeholders to support and promote women to senior positions. Useful resources and readings are available at the end of the unit.

• Unit 9 - <u>Searching for gender-sensitive media policies</u> - The politics of media and communication seems to be gradually evolving, though very slowly and at an uneven pace, towards more gender-aware approaches. In this unit we discuss the challenges of making gender mainstreaming in media and ICT a reality at different levels, from the local context of media organisations to the global environment where normative frameworks are elaborated. We clarify the 'why' and 'what' of gender-sensitive and gender-responsive media and ICT policies, and provide examples from the collection of good practices of the AGEMI project's Resources Bank.

Related students' project/s

- <u>Violence Against LGBTQIA+ Activists in China, Italy, Morocco and Spain.</u> This project offers an interactive mapping of existing different laws and policies surrounding freedom of expression on LGBTQIA+ issues in four countries- China, Italy, Morocco and Spain and shows how legal frameworks are necessary to protect freedom of expression yet are not necessarily sufficient to avoid violence and harassment towards gender and sexual minorities.
- Women dissidents of the 21st century. This project focuses on 6 striking cases of Chinese and Russian journalists and politicians who had to leave their native country for daring to resist the regime. It shows how patriarchal societies weaken the position of women in public life.

• <u>Women and journalism around the world: Protection and democratic systems in Albania, Chile and Nigeria.</u> This project compares the experience of being a female journalist in three countries - Albania, Chile and Nigeria - and observes how different cultural, historical, social, and political environments impact the professional experience of female journalists.

Other sources

European Commission (2022). Report on gender equality in the EU https://commission.europa.eu/system/files/2022-

<u>06/annual_report_ge_2022_printable_en.pdf</u>

European Parliament (2018) - Gender equality in the media sector https://www.europarl.europa.eu/thinktank/en/document/IPOL_STU(2018)596839

Council of Europe - Gender Equality Commission

https://www.coe.int/en/web/genderequality/gender-equality-commission?pk_campaign=newsletter

Inspiring readings

Eddy, K., Selva, M., & Nielsen, R. K., (2022). Women and leadership in the news media 2022: evidence from 12 markets.

https://reutersinstitute.politics.ox.ac.uk/women-and-leadership-newsmedia-2022-evidence-12-markets

Herstory: listen to 34 journalists' stories about fighting for gender equality - http://herstory.rjionline.org/home.html

Module 2 - Selecting a news story: Toward a gender-positive newsworthiness

Key concepts: agenda, newsworthiness

The pedagogical goal of this second module deals with tackling gender imbalance and gender inequalities embedded in the process of news selection. Two concepts are at the heart of news selection: agenda setting (how news media companies influence the public agenda regarding which issues are most important) and newsworthiness (how journalists evaluate the relevance of an event).

Regarding agenda setting, the news agenda is dominated by hard news, including politics and government affairs and economics. Hard news represent between 40% to 50% of the topics covered in newspaper, television and radio news, depending on the region of the world (GMMP 2020)[23]. For these hard news topics, traditionally deemed as masculine, women are usually under-represented and account for less than 25% of the subjects or interviewees[24]. Gender-related news on the contrary represents between 0 and 2% of the news topics (GMMP 2020).

In line with the priorities of the news agenda, the first step towards the creation of a news story for a journalist consists in selecting a newsworthy story to cover. The theory of newsworthiness (Östgaard, 1965[25]; Galtung & Ruge, 1965[26]) suggests that some editorial content is perceived as more relevant than others. The evaluation of a newsworthy story depends on the appreciation of journalists (Schulz, 1976)[27] and/or on editors-in-chief. It is traditionally influenced by certain news factors such as, amongst others, geographical proximity, actuality or controversy.

[23] GMMP 2020 - Who makes the news? - Table 8 https://whomakesthenews.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/11/GMMP2020.ENG_.FINAL_.pdf [24] *lbid*, Table 10

[25] Östgaard, E. (1965). Factors Influencing the Flow of News. Journal of Peace Research, 2(1), 39-63.

[26] Galtung, J., & Ruge, M. H. (1965). The Structure of Foreign News: The Presentation of the Congo, Cuba and Cyprus Crises in Four Norwegian Newspapers. *Journal of Peace Research*, 2(1), 64–90.

Another factor that can impact newsworthiness is gender. The editorial relevance of a news story, or part of a news story, is likely to be affected by the gender of the main protagonist(s). Some stories that are considered as relevant for women would be considered completely irrelevant for men. In other words, newsworthiness often appears to be gender-biased.

This module will focus on why newsworthiness can be gender-biased and how to advance towards a gender positive newsworthiness, in order to influence the agenda setting. At the end of this module, participants will be able to confront gender inequalities in the representation of female politicians in news and current affairs from the very first step of the creation of a news story: the news selection.

Module targets

This module aims at:

- 1/ Elaborating a comprehensive definition of gender-equal newsworthiness;
- 2/ Identifying some stereotyped topics that are considered as newsworthy when portraying women;
- 3/ Understanding the importance of applying the "rule of reversibility" when selecting some editorial content or when conducting an interview.

Reaching Target 1 - Elaborate a comprehensive definition of gender equal newsworthiness

Everyday, news outlets decide which events are worth covering and which events are not, based on their news agenda. In doing so, they evaluate the newsworthiness of a story. Gender may impact the evaluation. Gender-biased newsworthiness can be defined as a prejudiced evaluation of the relevance of a news story based on the gender-based perception that women are not equal to men. Gender-biased newsworthiness is often linked to patriarchy in which, or what is considered masculine, is accorded more importance than what is considered feminine. As such, politics and foreign affairs are, for example, often considered as masculine.

Some figures, extracted from the GMMP 2020 report show how newsworthiness can be gendered:

- Women tend to be interviewed more on local subjects (29%) than on national (25%), regional (21%) or international stories (24%);
- However, women are more likely to be subjects in news published on digital platforms, particularly on news websites, than in traditional media.

Suggested exercises

Exercise 1 - Get the definition of newsworthiness right

Small group brainstorming:

- What does newsworthiness mean? How is it influenced by agenda setting?
- What criteria do you use to evaluate the newsworthiness of a story?
- Can newsworthiness be gender-biased?
- Are some topics more interesting when related to women than when related to men?
- Can intersectionality impact newsworthiness and agenda setting?

Tips for trainers when reporting the findings

- It is important to discuss traditional factors of newsworthiness. Gender is often not included in traditional criteria, yet it is often a factor of choices. Some topics are rarely dealt with in interviews of female politicians for example. Why is that? Some topics are not addressed in interviews with male politicians. Why?
- Other factors may also impact newsworthiness, such as intersectionality. Provide a definition of intersectionality.
- Counter traditional arguments such as "yes, but there are less female experts" (module 1 showed it is wrong) and "Women are usually less likely to participate" (this may be linked to fear of harassment as an answer to their participation)
- Do you think that the gender of the journalist impacts the evaluation of newsworthiness? (see Lavie & Lehman-Wilzig, 2004)

Useful Resources

AGEMI - Unit 7 - Gender+: Intersectionality and the media

The ways in which gender is always inscribed with all the other aspects of ourselves is often overlooked, so in this unit we consider how we never are 'just' our sex, our gender is always changeable and, accepting that gender itself is a social construct, this unit asks us to think about the relationship between sex and gender and consider how the various other aspects of our unique selves, our abilities, our race and ethnic background, our age, our class, all contribute to our sense of identity and will come to the fore in particular circumstances, at particular times.

Academic sources

18(1), 5–29.

Atkinson, C. (2021) An analysis of the role of gender in political news media coverage. *Independent Study Project (ISP) Collection*, 3392. Lavie, A.,& Lehman-Wilzig, S. (2004). Whose news? Does gender determine the editorial product? *European Journal of Communication*,

Crenshaw, K. (2019) *On Intersectionality: Essential writings*. New York: The New Press.

Other sources

The components of newsworthiness.

https://owl.purdue.edu/owl/subject_specific_writing/journalism_and_journalistic_writing/components_of_newsworthiness.html

Timothy, R.K. (8 March 2019) What is Intersectionality? All of who I amhttps://theconversation.com/what-is-intersectionality-all-of-who-i-am-

TEDWomen (2016) The urgency of intersectionality, Kimberlé Crenshaw

https://www.ted.com/talks/kimberle_crenshaw_the_urgency_of_intersectionality

Reaching target 2 - Identify some stereotyped topics that are considered as newsworthy when portraying women (cis & trans)

Based on patriarchal criteria, newsworthiness is often defined according to gender stereotypes, that are preconceived ideas, according to which women are arbitrarily assigned characteristics and roles determined and limited by their sex.[28] Among the most common gender stereotypes that trigger gender-biased newsworthiness, are what Duerst-Lahti (2006, p. 37)[29] calls 'hair, husband and hemline' problem":

• The "hair" encompasses all topics related to physical appearance. Among the most common examples, Hillary Clinton's blond bob has attracted a lot of coverage (see for example Hillary's hair: She's in on the joke). "Hair" stories often contain a sexualising character such as Angela Merkel's decolletage or "weapon of mass distraction", Theresa May and Nicola Sturgeon's legs. In these cases, the true topic is completely overlooked. Another aspect that could be integrated in the "hair", is age. The extensive coverage of Hillary Clinton's fiftieth birthday is a good example of this.

At age 50, would Hillary Clinton still be able to run for office? The question is almost never raised for men, who can be often elected well into their 60s, or it is raised at a much more advanced age. For example, some questions were raised about Joe Biden's ability to run for his first presidential term at 78 and are currently renewed as he may run for a second presidential term at 82. Being young can also be a topic, when Virginia Raggi was elected as mayor of Roma at age 37, she was portrayed as young and gorgeous, overlooking her qualification and her victory.

- The "husband" encompasses all the aspects linked to family status. The most prominent expected idea of women is that they are mothers. A political figure's motherhood is often considered newsworthy. Some prominent political figures such as US Vice President Kamala Harris or former Australian Prime Minister Julia Gillard have faced serious political attacks for not having children. Gillard was described in a Sydney Morning Herald Editorial: "Her media persona does not fit the expectations of some voters: a single woman, childless, whose life is dedicated to her career.". An excellent example is how Hillary Clinton was also often portrayed as a grand-mother.
- Finally the "Hemline" encompasses all fashion choices. Female politicians are often criticised in the media or at least their outfits are often commented on. These unjustified articles on fashion choices have to be differentiated from obvious political fashion choices. For example, Alexandra Ocasio-Cortez, probably knowing that her dress would be commented on anyway, added a strong political message to her outfit when she attended the MET gala in 2021. In this case, she was certainly sending a strong message to the media.

The emphasis on such stories tends to diminish the credentials and accomplishments of female politicians.

Suggested exercise- Get your maths right

Individual exercise. Participants can examine their portfolio of news stories and do some quick maths

- In how many stories is "the hair" for men/women mentioned?
- In how many stories is the wife/husband for men/women mentioned?
- In how many stories is the hemline for men/women mentioned?

Tip: this exercise can also examine a sample of articles made on a database such as Factiva or even Google News (in this case, you can mention possible algorithmic bias).

Tips for trainers when reporting the findings

Focus on the following points:

- Does the quick maths match Duerst-Lahti's conclusions? Why?
 Emphasise the different levels of responsibility mentioned in module 1 (national culture, organisational culture, individual choice, audience's preference)
- Reflect on the increasing personalisation of politics over the past twenty years. How does it contribute to gender inequalities?
- Emphasise intersectional considerations: visibility of LGBTQIA+, ethnicity, social background
- What is the impact of gender-biased newsworthiness? Mention objectification and trivialisation.

Useful resources

Institutional resources

WAN-IFRA (2020). Amplifying women's voices. A gender balance guide for media.

https://womeninnews.org/ckfinder/userfiles/files/Gender%20Balance%20Guidebook_FINAL_RGB%20(1).pdf

Module 2 - Selecting a news story: Toward a gender-positive newsworthiness

Name It -Change It. New research explained by sticky figures http://www.nameitchangeit.org/blog/entry/Name-It-Change-Its-New-Research-Explained-By-Stick-Figures

Center for Intersectional Justice - What Is Intersectionality? https://www.intersectionaljustice.org/what-is-intersectionality
CRIAW-ICREF - Feminist Intersectionality posters https://www.criaw-icref.ca/wp-content/uploads/2021/04/Feminist-Intersectionality-Poster.pdf

Academic sources

O'Neill, D., Savigny, H., & Cann, V. (2016) Women politicians in the UK press: not seen and not heard?, *Feminist Media Studies*, 16(2), 293-307

Dan, V., & Iorgoveanu, A. (2013). Still on the beaten path: How gender impacted the coverage of male and female Romanian candidates for European Office. *The International Journal of Press/Politics*, 18(2), 208—233.

Related students' project/s

• <u>Issues in gender representation in the political sphere. A reflection on gender stereotypes in the context of the Italian, Polish and English language.</u> This project reflects on gender stereotypes, analysing articles and interviews in the context of the Italian, Polish and English language.

Reaching target 3 - Understand the importance of applying the "rule of reversibility" when selecting some editorial content or when conducting an interview.

One of the solutions to avoid gender-biased evaluation of newsworthiness is in applying the "rule of reversibility": if you wouldn't ask a question to a man, don't ask it to a woman; if you wouldn't say something about a male candidate, don't use those words about his female counterpart.

However, besides the application of the rule of reversibility, a step forward towards gender equality in representation in the media would be to go from gender-equal newsworthiness to gender-positive newsworthiness. Gender-positive newsworthiness could be defined as an evaluation of the relevance of news that challenges traditional and harmful criteria to select news stories.

The idea of gender-positive newsworthiness would imply going further than applying the rule of reversibility with questions such as:

- Is my first idea to interview a man/a woman? Explain why.
- Can I modify my first idea?
- If my first idea was to interview a man, is there a woman that is equally competent on the topic?
- Is the topic I am writing about traditionally associated with male/female characteristics? Can I interview a politician from the opposite gender?

Suggested exercise- Towards gender-positive newsworthiness

Individual exercise. On small pieces of paper, participants prepare a short summary of an interview of a political figure contained in their portfolio.

In a group. Participants try to guess who was the political figure interviewed by their colleagues

Tips for trainers when reporting the findings

Focus on the following points:

- Did the group get it right? Could they distinguish between cis/trans/male/female politicians? Why?
- Did participants include some gendered elements in their description?
- How can we increase the newsworthiness of cisgender and transgender women and how to enhance their position in the news agenda?

Useful resources

Related students' project/s

<u>Down with stereotypes! Media errors and how to raise awareness</u>
 <u>of stereotypes about powerful women.</u> This project aims at
 opening people's minds about gender stereotypes in the media by
 applying the rule of reversibility to a series of news stories
 focusing on political leaders

Module 3 - Framing a news story

Key concepts: Framing, double bind, episodic framing vs. thematic framing, frame setting vs. frame sending

The pedagogical target of this third module consists in understanding the power of framing, and more specifically of gendered framing. Framing refers to the process of assembling some elements such as keywords, images or sentences in a specific way, in order to create a narrative (also called a 'frame') that promotes a particular interpretation of a situation or a story. According to sociologist Robert Entman (1993)[30], the frames perform four functions: 1/ they define problems, 2/ they diagnose causes for the defined problems, 3/ they make a moral judgement and evaluate causal agents and their effects, and 4/ they promote a remedy, that is to propose and justify treatments for the diagnosed problems. In doing so, frames shape the audience's inherent interpretations, encouraging target audiences to think, feel and decide in a particular way.

Research has shown evidence that journalists tend to use gendered frames when portraying women politicians in the news. These frames often put women at a disadvantage, as opposed to their male counterparts. For example, journalists are more likely to mention the gender of a woman politician than for a male politician (Falk, 2008) [31], framing politics as a masculine domain. According to Gidengil & Everitt (1999, p.49)[32], such an "application of conventional political frames to women politicians can result in subtle and insidious forms of gender bias".

This module will target gendered framing as a source of gender inequality in politics and focus on some commonly used harmful frames such as the "woman can't have it all" frame, posing the incompatibility between a political role and motherhood, or the aggressive and emotional portrayal of female leadership. At the end of this module, participants will be able to identify hidden framing and to fight some deeply ingrained framing automatism.

Module Goals

This third module aims at:

- 1/ Uncovering and analysing frames in news stories;
- 2/ Understanding the 'double bind' dilemma created by a cisgender masculine framing of leadership;
- 3/ Eliminating gendered frames from news stories.

Reaching Target 1 - Uncover and analyse frames in news stories

According to Kuypers (2009)[33], framing is "the process whereby communicators act—consciously or not—to construct a particular point of view that encourages the facts of a given situation to be viewed in a particular manner, with some facts made more or less noticeable (even ignored) than others. When highlighting some aspect of reality over other aspects, frames act to define problems, diagnose causes, make moral judgments, and suggest remedies. They are located in the communicator, the text, the receiver, and the culture at large. Frames are central organising ideas within a narrative account of an issue or event; they provide the interpretive cues for otherwise neutral facts".

Let's see how female political leaders are often framed as mothers who "can't have it all". The idea of "having it all" has evolved over time. According to Bonnie J. Miller McLemore (1996)[34], the expression "having it all" arose in the 1960's, as criticism of feminist movements who wanted to "have it all", meaning equality in the marketplace and within the household. Relocated from its original context, the expression "having it all" undoubtedly carries a strong moral connotation, suggesting that having it all may not be reasonable. This vision, inherited from the 1960s, is still often applied to female politicians who combine a high-powered career and a family. In recent years, women who were questioned if they could "have it all" are, among others: Former New Zealand Prime Minister Jacinda Ardern, Hillary Clinton, and Illinois General Attorney Lisa Madigan.

Such a frame suggests that women cannot combine motherhood with a career as a political leader. However, single and female leaders without children (such as former Australian Prime Minister Julia Gillard) are often framed as not matching the voters' expectations because they are too ambitious and dedicated to their career. All these contradicting frames are contributing to describing women politicians as "acting in an unnatural sphere" and men as "more appropriate in these positions" (Falk, 2008, p. 94), whatever the cultural and legal environment.[35]

Suggested exercise - Women can't have it all

Small group analysis. Participants will analyse the frame used for three news stories.

- 1 new story framing a political leader who can't have it all (usually cis/trans women).
- 1 new story framing a political leader who has it all (most common among men).
- 1 new story framing a political leader who is portrayed as childless (usually cis/trans women).

[34] Miller-McLemore, B. (1996) Family and Work: Can Anyone 'Have It All'? in Anne E. Carr and Mary Stewart Van Leeuwen (eds). *Religion, Feminism, and the Family*. Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press. pp. 275-93.
[35] Falk, E. (2008). *Women for President: Media bias in eight campaigns*. Chicago, IL: University of Illinois Press.

(**Tips**: the example of common frame used for politicians can be adapted to your country)

Participants will extract the four components of framing:

- The problems defined in the news stories.
- The causes of this problem as diagnosed by the author(s).
- The moral judgement made by the author(s).
- The remedies suggested by the author(s).

Tips for trainers when reporting the findings

Focus on the following points:

- What are the four components of the frames studied?
- What is the impact of the 'have it all' frame on the audience? What does it imply?
- What can be the consequences of framing in general, including for cis and trans female political leaders?
- How could the chosen frames be more gender-balanced?
- Is the legal environment mentioned as a problem/a cause/ or a remedy? Reflect on the importance of the legal environment as a key facilitator to have it all.

Useful resources

Academic articles

Schreiber, R. (2016). Gender roles, motherhood, and politics: Conservative women's organizations frame Sarah Palin and Michele Bachmann. *Journal of Women, Politics & Policy*, 37(1), 1-23

Arfini, E., Ghigi, R. & Magaraggia, S. (2019). Can feminism be right? A content analysis of discourses about women by female Italian right-wing politicians. *Rassegna Italiana di Sociologia*, 60(4), 693-719

Related students' project/s

- <u>Being the first: Female leaders from Greece, Italy and Lithuania.</u>

 This project focuses on the media representation of three female leaders: Greek President Katerina Sakellaropoulou, Italian Prime Minister Giorgia Meloni and Lithuanian Prime Minister Ingrida Šimonytė. These three women are the first female politicians to hold such a position in their respective countries.
- The climb of Georgia Meloni. In November 2022, Georgia Meloni, the leader of the nationalist party Brothers of Italy (Fratelli d'Italia), became the first female Italian Prime Minister. She is also at the head of the most right-wing government since the end of World War II. This project proposes a framing analysis of the media coverage received by Giorgia Meloni, a month before and a month after her nomination.

Other sources

research Center - Framing - https://www.pewresearch.org/journalism/1998/07/13/frame/Globalvoices.org - Why the news frame matters (parts 1 and 2) https://newsframes.globalvoices.org/2017/02/09/why-the-news-frame-matters/

https://newsframes.globalvoices.org/2017/04/03/spotting-the-news-frame/

Reaching Target 2 - Understand the 'double bind' dilemma created by the cisgender masculine framing of leadership

While male figures tend to be reported as strong leaders and associated with so-called masculine traits such as strength, competitiveness, effectiveness, intelligence and tenacity; female politicians are more likely to be reported as weak and emotional outsiders, associated with honesty and compassion (see, for example, Meeks 2012)[36]. Such a gendered perception is reinforced for women from a minority background, black women being usually perceived as too polarising, and Asian women as too docile to be good leaders. However, if women politicians show some traits usually associated with men, they tend to be criticised as incredibly tough leaders with aggressive behaviour. (Fernandez-Garcia, 2010).[37]

Such a gendered framing of leadership confronts women politicians with a "double bind" dilemma, meaning they receive conflicting messages regarding what is expected from them. This double bind makes it incredibly complex for cisgender and transgender women to define a good political strategy (Ono & Yamada, 2018)[38].

Suggested exercise - Tough men vs. aggressive women

Small group exercise. Participants will analyse the frame of leadership, using the four components of framing (Problem, causes, moral judgement, remedies) for four articles.

- News stories framing a cisgender female political leader as aggressive / compassionate.
- News story framing a male political leader as strong.
- News story framing a transgender political leader.
- News story with a less stereotypical frame.

^[36] Meeks, L. (2012). Is She 'Man Enough'? Women Candidates, Executive Political Offices, and News Coverage. *Journal of Communication*; 62 (1), pp. 175–93

^[37] Fernandez-Garcia, N. (2010). Framing Hillary Clinton en la Prensa Española: ¿Candidata o Mujer?. Observatorio (OBS*) Journal, 4(3), 209 – 228.

^[38] Ono, Y., & Yamada, M. (2020). Do voters prefer gender stereotypic candidates? Evidence from a conjoint survey experiment in Japan. *Political Science Research and Methods*, 8(3), 477-492.

Tips for trainers when reporting the findings

Focus on the following points

- Are male/female (cis and trans) leadership framed in the same manner? Observe recurring patterns/ similarities/differences.
- Are leadership qualities traditionally masculine or feminine? What about the 'feminisation' of masculine emotion and vice-versa?
 Does it mean greater gender equality?
- Are female leaders expected to have the same qualities as women in general? (see Schneider & Bos, 2004)
- How does framing impact political strategies? Introduce the notion of double-bind.
- Discuss the fact that some female leaders feel compelled to portray themselves as mothers to soften their image.
- Over the past twenty years, the personalisation, that is the disclosing of one's personal side, has been a major trend in politics. Does this trend affect women more than men?
- Focus on violence and harassment that cis and trans female political leaders can experience.
- Add some news stories during Covid. Has Covid-19 changed this gendered vision of leadership? The excellent management of the recent pandemic by some female leaders has been internationally recognised. Is it a positive sign of change? (See related student project - Women taking charge when the crucial moment comes in the suggested sources).

Suggested sources

AGEMI training

• Unit 3 - <u>Gender and the strategic use of language</u>

The representation of women and men in media discourse is at risk of gender bias. In this unit, we talk about the intrinsic characteristics and routine uses of language that can result in such gender-based biases. Focusing on the grammatical features of different languages and the grammatical choices available to us, we also present examples of good practices for a gender-sensitive use of language.

[36] Meeks, L. (2012). Is She 'Man Enough'? Women Candidates, Executive Political Offices, and News Coverage. *Journal of Communication*; 62 (1), 175–93

[37] Fernandez-Garcia, N. (2010). Framing Hillary Clinton en la Prensa Española: ¿Candidata o Mujer?. *Observatorio* (OBS*) Journal, 4(3), 209 – 228.

We also talk about how key terms which are part of the 'gender agenda' are used in the AGEMI project and resources, as well as considering how policy discourse reflects principles and norms. Useful resources and readings at the end of the unit.

Related students' project/s

 Women taking charge when the crucial moment comes - video project about female leadership during the crucial moments of the Covid-19 pandemic. The aim of this project is to shed light on the discrimination and obstacles that women face when they choose a career in politics.

Academic sources

Curnalia, R. M., & Mermer, D. L. (2014) The "Ice Queen" Melted and It Won Her the Primary: Evidence of Gender Stereotypes and the Double Bind in News Frames of Hillary Clinton's "Emotional Moment", *Qualitative Research Reports in Communication*, 15(1), 26-32

Teele, D., Kalla, J., & Rosenbluth, F. (2018). The Ties That Double Bind: Social Roles and Women's Underrepresentation in Politics. *American Political Science Review*, 112(3), 525-541.

McKay, F. (2020). Gender and Media Representation: Politics and the "Double Bind". In: Smith, A. (eds). *Gender Equality in Changing Times*. Palgrave Macmillan, Cham.

Schneider, M. C., & Bos, A. L. (2014). Measuring Stereotypes of Female Politicians. *Political Psychology*, 35(2), 245–266.

Other sources

Catalyst - The double-bind dilemma for women in leadership: Damned if you do, doomed if you don't -

https://www.empowerwomen.org/en/resources/documents/2015/12/the-doublebind-dilemma-for-women-in-leadershipdamned-if-you-do-doomed-if-you-dont?lang=en

Catalyst - The Double bind dilemma for women in leadership https://www.catalyst.org/research/infographic-the-double-bind-dilemma-for-women-in-leadership/

Harvard Business Review - How Women Manage the Gendered Norms of Leadership https://hbr.org/2018/11/how-women-manage-the-gendered-norms-of-leadership

Reaching Target 3: Eliminate gendered frames from your news stories

Journalists use frames, as patterns of interpretation, to make sense of the world surrounding them (Hartley, 1996[39]). Studying frames is going beyond personal opinions. Frames are deeply rooted in society. When framing news stories, they can either "pass on interpretations provided by other actors", what Brüggemann (2014, p.62[40]) calls "frame sending" - or they can provide their own individual interpretations of a situation based on their socio-cultural values, that is "frame setting" in opposition to frame sending. News stories are usually a mixture of both, considering the collective culture within a newsroom and the collaboration between journalists and sources.

Differentiating frame setting elements from frame sending elements in one's news story helps to understand how frames were built, by whom, for which purposes and with which consequences. Such an understanding helps to raise journalists' awareness regarding how they are making sense of the world. It can contribute to limiting the spread of gender-biased frames and favouring the emergence of gender-positive frames.

[39] Hartley, J. (1996). *Popular reality: Journalism, modernity, popular culture*. London, England: Arnold. [40] Bruggemann, M. (2014). Between frame setting and frame sending: How journalists contribute to news frames. *Communication Theory*, 24(1), 61–82.

Suggested exercise - Self-evaluation

Individual reflection

Participants can check their portfolio and identify frames they often use:

- Highlight some examples of mentions of gendered leadership framing
- Observe how the frame was constructed (frame setting or frame sending)
- Apply the rule of reversibility to the frames selected. What can you observe?
- Are men and women portrayed differently?
- What are the moral judgements underpinning the frames?

Tips for trainers when reporting the findings

Focus on the following points:

- Existing gendered framing patterns. How efficient is the rule of reversibility to identify gendered framing patterns?
- Focus on the elements of frame setting and frame sending. How to avoid frame sending of gendered frames? How to increase frame sending of gender-positive frames?
- Guide the discussion towards a comprehensive definition of gender equal framing, when portraying political leaders in news and current affairs
- Open the conversation to other aspects of common frames: women as victims, femicide as love (see suggested sources). How to transform episodic framing into thematic framing?
- Discuss Holman and Schneider (2018) (see suggested sources).
 How framing the under-representation of intersectional women in politics as a consequence of the absence of suitable candidates is discouraging political participation.

Suggested sources

Academic sources

Holman, M. R., & Schneider, M. C. (2018). Gender, race, and political ambition: how intersectionality and frames influence interest in political office. *Politics, Groups, and Identities*, 6(2), 264-280.

Feezell, J. T., Glazier, R. A., & Boydstun, A. E. (2021) Framing, identity, and responsibility: do episodic vs. thematic framing effects vary by target population?, *Politics, Groups, and Identities*, 9(20), 347-368.

Related students' project/s

 <u>Remapping the story.</u> This project consists of an online mapping of the good and bad practices in terms of female representation in the media at an international level.

Other sources

Buitten, D. (2023) Why do men who kill their families still receives sympathetic news coverage. https://theconversation.com/why-do-men-who-kill-their-families-still-receive-sympathetic-news-coverage-198066

Frameworks (2017) Episodic vs. thematic framinghttps://www.frameworksinstitute.org/article/episodic-vs-thematicstories/

Module 4 - News writing: Fighting gendered writing automatisms

Key concepts: Critical Discourse Analysis

While Modules 2 and 3 targeted blatant gender stereotypes in news selection and news framing, Module 4 will focus on news writing, and more specifically on eliminating subtle gender biases often hidden in news articles. These can hide in any linguistic form, such as the use of a specific lexicon, a syntactic construction, or any other element of language, depending on the context. Their use is often unconscious, resulting mostly from writing automatisms. However, they are harmful in that they reproduce existing patterns of domination in our societies.

The pedagogical target of this module consists of raising journalists' awareness regarding the existence of these subtle gender biases hidden in language, and to make them reconsider their writing habits and automatisms through critical discourse analysis (CDA). CDA focuses on "social interactions which take linguistic forms" (Wodak, 1997, p. 173)[41]. It reveals power dynamics through linguistic analysis. Syntactical and semantic choices carry meanings that reflect "structure of dominance, power, discrimination, and control" (Wodak, 1995, p.2004)[42]. Such choices can contribute to objectifying female politicians, impacting their political credibility, lessening their contribution to the political action, undermining their leadership, etc.

(eds). Handbook of Pragmatics (pp.204-10). Amsterdam: Benjamins,

Module Goals

This fourth module aims to:

- 1/ Detect gendered writing automatisms through Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA);
- 2/ Debunk one's gendered writing automatisms
- 3/ Replacing deeply ingrained gendered writing habits by genderneutral writing habits

Reaching Target 1 - Detect gendered writing automatisms through Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA)

Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) focuses on "social interactions which take linguistic forms" (Wodak, 1997, p. 173)[43]. In other words, CDA consists of an in-depth linguistic analysis, whose strength lies in highlighting power dynamics contained in syntactic and semantic choices. Power dynamics can be overt or more subtle.

In practice, Critical Discourse Analysis can be divided into three steps:

Step 1 - Study the language choices

Unpack the news story:

- Check the use of names, surnames, pronouns.
- What kinds of verbs are used action verbs? verbs of perception and cognition? Are the verbs mainly transitive or intransitive? Are modal verbs and modal expressions used?
- How many adjectives are used and what point of view do they convey?
- What semantic field is being used?

Step 2 - Interpret the language choices

Examine your findings:

- To what extent are words, phrases and grammatical structures used to reveal and conceal socio-cultural values?
- How would you describe the interaction between the protagonists of the story? Focus on the protagonists' status and relationship
- What is being spoken about? What are the goals of this story?

Step 3 - Draw conclusion regarding power dynamics

Extract the main power relationships conveyed by the story:

 What are the main socio-cultural structures of dominance revealed in the story?

Suggested exercise - First steps in Critical Discourse Analysis

Critical discourse analysis in small groups. Participants perform a critical discourse analysis of two or three relevant pieces of news following the steps detailed above.

Tips for trainers when reporting the findings. Here are some tips.

- Follow the different steps of the analysis to get participants used to the CDA methodology
- Focus on the connotations contained in different semantic elements: names, pronouns, verbs, adjectives
- Summarise the most common subtle gender biases

Suggested sources

Academic resources

van Dijk, T.A. (2005). Critical Discourse Analysis. In D. Schiffrin, D. Tannen and H.E. Hamilton (eds). *The Handbook of Discourse Analysis*.

Sriwimon, L., & Zilli, P. J. (2017) Applying Critical Discourse Analysis as a conceptual framework for investigating gender stereotypes in political media discourse. *Kasetsart Journal of Social Sciences*, 38(2), 136-142.

Related students' project/s

- Fill in the blank! Does the media coverage in the public sphere imply a difference between women and men? This project proposes a pedagogical game fill in the blank. For a series of selected texts in which names and pronouns have been cut out, the viewer only relies on sections of the text to take their own guess on the gender of the subject of the article. This game highlights how language can carry gender stereotypes.
- <u>The representation of Giorgia Meloni in the international press</u> <u>before and after the elections.</u> This project focuses on how the <u>French</u>, English and Spanish press have portrayed Giorgia Meloni during her political campaign as head of the Fratelli d'Italia party and after her election as Prime Minister.
- Transgender politicians: how to be represented in the national press. This project analyses how transgender women are represented in the Italian and UK national press. It focuses on two transgender female political figures, Italian former member of parliament and writer Vladimir Luxuria and British MP Jamie Wallis.

Other sources

Languagehumanities.org. What is Critical Discourse Analysis? https://www.languagehumanities.org/what-is-critical-discourse-analysis.htm

Friedrich, P. (2016). What's in a title? When it comes to doctor, more than you might think https://theconversation.com/whats-in-a-title-when-it-comes-to-doctor-more-than-you-might-think-127979

Reaching target 2 - Debunking one's gendered writing automatisms

Detecting one's ingrained and often unconscious linguistic gender biases is difficult, as it consists in redefining one's socio-cultural values. Through self-critical discourse analysis, participants will make a list of the linguistic gender biases they commonly use.

Gender biases	Solution
E.g I use a lot of masculine words such as forefathers	I can replace them by gender neutral words such as ancestors. Examples of gender neutral language that you can use in English and in French: https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000377299

Suggested exercise - Self-analysis

Individual analysis. Participants conduct an in-depth critical discourse analysis of three news stories chosen from their portfolio and complete the first column of the list of hidden biases (see above)

- --> Cross-analysis in pairs. Participants exchange their news stories and perform a CDA on their work partner's news stories and complete the list of biases observed. Participants will discuss their cross-results
 - How many biases remained unnoticed by the author?
 - Do they share some biases?
 - Tip: use mixed gender pairs

Tips for trainers when reporting the findings.

- Make a list of the most common biases/ most common unnoticed biases and organise them into categories
- Which semantic elements are most likely to carry unwanted gendered connotations?

Suggested resources

Academic sources

Formanowicz, M., & Hansen, K. (2022). Subtle linguistic cues affecting gender in (equality). *Journal of Language and Social Psychology*, 41(2), 127-147

Sensales, G., & Areni, A. (2017). Gender biases and linguistic sexism in political communication: A comparison of press news about men and women Italian ministers. *Journal of Social and Political Psychology*, 5(2), 512–536.

Reaching Target 3 - Replace deeply ingrained gendered writing habits by gender neutral writing habits

This activity is a follow-up of Target 2. While, for Target 2, participants will make a list of the linguistic gender biases they commonly use, for Target 3, they will develop alternative expressions to overcome their bias in writing.

Suggested exercises

Group analysis. Participants will complete the second column of the worksheet (see target 2) and propose some solutions to their biases.

Cross-analysis in pairs. Participants will exchange their worksheets and evaluate the solutions proposed to avoid biases.

- Is the proposed solution gender neutral?
- Are there some alternative/additional solutions?

Reporting the findings. Focus on the following points.

- Share the solutions
- Focus on a gender appropriate lexicon for transgender (pronouns, names, dead names. Especially for language that does not have a neutral case)
- Establish a no-no list and a list of best practices that participants can keep

Suggested resources

Institutional resources

UNESCO - Guidelines on gender-sensitive language https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000377299.locale=en
UN - Guidelines for gender-inclusive language in English - https://www.un.org/en/gender-inclusive-language/guidelines.shtml

UN. Guidelines for gender-inclusive language in English Toolbox - Self-paced activity: Apply the guidelines to a text - https://www.un.org/en/gender-inclusive-language/assets/pdf/EN-Toolbox-Apply-the-guidelines-to-a-text_(self-paced).pdf
The safe zone - LGBTQ-inclusive language: Do and Don't https://thesafezoneproject.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/SZP-Language-DO-DONT-Handout.pdf

Related students' project/s

 If you don't see the problem... How sexist terminology is used to represent women in the media. This project focuses on the choice of language and terminology used by the media to describe political figures and their political actions. It shows the different and often sexist treatment received by female politicians in the news.

Module 5 - Choose your illustration: Gender balanced multimodality and visual semiotics

Key concepts: Multimodality, Intertextuality, Face-ism, Body-ism, online harassment

According to Jia et al. (2016[44]), "when women do show up in the news, it is often as eye candy, thus reinforcing women's value as sources of visual pleasure rather than residing in the content of their views".

Such a sexist use of images is even more frightening because "pictures are more imperative than writing, they impose meaning at one stroke, without analysing or diluting it" (Barthes, 1972)[45]. Therefore, Module 5 deals with gender biases in images, including static pictures, broadcasting and digital multimodal compositions such as tweets. Visual images, like all representations, "are never innocent or neutral reflections of reality...they re-present for us: that is, they offer not a mirror of the world but an interpretation of it" (Midalia, 1999, p. 131)[46].

As Goffman (1976, p. 11)[47] suggested, media representation is a key symbolic arena in which a gendered "social structure of hierarchy or value" is manifested and reproduced. These biases contained in visual communication have an important effect on politics. They can affect candidate assessments (Coleman & Banning, 2006[48]; Coleman & Wu, 2015[49]) as well as voting decisions (Banducci et al., 2008[50]). It is therefore important to tackle them.

[44] Jia, S., Lansdall-Welfare, T., Sudhahar, S., Carter, C., & Cristianini, N. (2016). Women are seen more than heard in online newspapers. *PloS One*, 1111(2):e0148434. https://journals.plos.org/plosone/article?id=10.1371/journal.pone.0148434 [45] Barthes, R. (1972). *Mythologies*. London: Cape

[46] Midalia, S. (1999). Textualising Gender. Interpretations, 32(1), 27-32.

[47] Goffman Erving. 1976. Gender Advertisements. New York: Macmillan International Higher Education.

[48] Coleman, R., & Banning, S. (2006). Network TV News' Affective Framing of the Presidential Candidates: Evidence for a Second-Level Agenda-Setting Effect through Visual Framing. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*, 83(2), 313–328. https://doi.org/10.1177/107769900608300206

[49] Coleman, R. & Wu, H.D. (2015,). *Image and emotion in voter decisions: The affect agenda.* New York: Lexington. [50] Banducci, S.A., Karp, J.A., Thrasher, M. Rallings, C. (2008), Ballot Photographs as Cues in Low-Information Elections. Political Psychology, 29:, 903-917. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9221.2008.00672.x

Participants will first be introduced to the grammar of visual design in order to identify gender biases in visual representations, before familiarising themselves with gender balance in broadcasting images, and multimodal compositions on social media platforms, especially on Twitter.

Module targets

This fifth module aims to:

- 1/ Understand the rules of visual design and multimodal composition in pictures;
- 2/ Eliminate gender biases from video broadcasting;
- 3/ Understand the specificities of tweets and other social media platforms' news snippets.

Reaching target 1 - Understand the rules of visual design and multimodal composition

Images, like texts, carry meaning. Meaning can be divided into two different sorts: 1) denoted meaning which refers to the direct recognition of what is represented on the image (e.g. an apple) - denoted meaning is straightforward and not ambiguous; and 2) connoted meaning which gives space to the audience for interpreting even against or beyond the authors' intention. (e.g the symbols carried by an apple)

In order to unfold these complexities, Kress and Van Leeuwen's grammar of visual design[51] constitutes a comprehensive toolkit to study the meaning of pictures and visual composition in western culture.

Keywords of the grammar of visual design:

- **Semiotics**: how representation, in the broad sense (language, images, objects) generates meaning or the processes by which we comprehend or attribute meaning.
- Multimodality: As Roland Barthes said: "the meaning of images (and of other semiotic codes) is always related to, and in a sense, dependent on verbal text" (Barthes, 1967, cited in Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006, p.17). Multimodality refers to this interplay between different representational modes, for instance, between images and the written/spoken word in order to generate meaning.
- Intertextuality: Intertextuality describes the existence of connections between media messages. A media message is interpreted using other existing media messages, by means of its implicit or explicit allusions.
- Face-ism (Archer et al., 1983)[52] refers to the facial prominence of subjects in pictures, measured by a face-ism index, defined as the distance from the top of the head to the lowest point of the chin divided by the distance from the top of the head to the lowest visible part of the subject's body. Men tend to have higher face-to-body ratios than women, as confirmed by the following literature (Nigro et al., 1988[53]; Copeland, 1989[54]). Photographs with high face prominence generate more positive ratings in terms of intelligence, ambition and physical appearance than those with low face prominence.

^[52] Archer, D., Iritani, B., Kimes, D., & Barrios, M. (1983). Face-ism: Five studies of sex differences in facial prominence. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*. 45 (4), 725–735.

^[53]Nigro, G., Hill, D., Gelbein, M.; Clark, C. (1988). Changes in the facial prominence of women and men over the last decade. *Psychology of Women Quarterly*. 12 (2), 225–235.

^[54] Copeland, G. (1989). Face-ism and primetime television. Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media. 33 (2), 209-214.

• Body-ism (Hall & Crum, 1994[55]) echoes the concept of face-ism and refers to the body prominence of subjects in pictures. Higher "body-ism" indexes for women reinforces the stereotypical images of women as decoration for men or sex objects, while higher face-ism of pictures portraying men might result in greater perception of competence, authority, credibility, dominance and control, characteristics associated with masculinity (Bretl & Cantor, 1988))[56].

Suggested exercise

Group analysis. Participants will analyse the front covers of one famous cisgender or transgender female leader in one or several magazines in the country over several years.

- What is the nature of the picture? Photography/drawing
- How is the leader represented? Face/ body.
- What is the person doing in the picture? Where is she?
- What colours are used?
- What is the facial expression?
- How are pictures and text combined to give meaning?
- What is the frame underpinning each cover?
- Can you group these covers by types of frames?
- If the selected politician is from a minority background, observe how intersectionality materialises

Tips for trainers when reporting the findings. Focus on the following points:

- What can be said about the evolution over time?
- What are the most common frames observed?
- How could you improve those covers?
- Which covers could most likely be used to portray a man? Why?
- If the selected politician is/isn't from a minority background, compare with another politician with a similar trajectory and reflect on the portrayal of intersectionality
- Introduce the concept of Body-ism and Face-ism

Suggested sources

Academic references

Kress, G., & Leeuwen, T.V. (2020). Reading images: The grammar of visual design (3rd ed.). Routledge.

Hall, S. (2021). The Determinations of News Photographs. In C. Brunsdon (Ed.). Writings on Media: History of the Present. New York: Duke University Press, 2021, 54-77.

Matthews, J.L. (2007). Hidden sexism: Facial prominence and its connections to gender and occupational status in popular print media. Sex Roles, 57, 515–525 (2007)

Miller, S. H. (1975). The content of news photos: Women's and men's roles. Journalism Quarterly, 52(1), 70–75.

News articles

Sarah Lewis (May 25, 2019). Sarah Lewis. The Racial Bias Built Into Photography.

The New York Times. https://www.nytimes.com/2019/04/25/lens/sarah-lewis-racial-bias-photography.html

Related students' project/s

 <u>Smile for the camera.</u> This research aims to comprehend how visuality affects people's perception, particularly regarding the representation of women and men through images. It analyses pictures of public figures using the concept of face-ism, that is the ratio of face and body in photographs of subjects.

Reaching Target 2 - Eliminate gender biases from video broadcasting

While women used to be proportionally better represented as news subjects and sources on TV than in other traditional media (21% on TV vs. 16% in newspapers and 15% on radio in 1995[57]), this difference has faded over the years. In 25 years, the representation of women as news subjects and sources on TV has increased by 5 percentage points to 25%, compared to a rise of 10 to 26% in newspapers and a rise of 8 to 23% in radio). The representation of trans and gender minorities is even more limited[58]. Women are often more reluctant than men to appear on television, an argument often put forward by journalists and TV producers to justify the lower number of women on screen.

In addition to being under-represented on television, women are often portrayed in a very stereotypical way. Television is considered as one of the primary sources of gender images. These gender images can be divided into two main categories: 1/ "hegemonic masculinity", which refers to images illustrating the subordination of women, male authority, aggression and technical competence; and 2/ "emphasised femininity", with images revolving around dependency, sexual attractiveness, and motherhood (Aulette, et al., 2009)[59].

The nature of the medium makes women's physical appearance and femininity the centre of open comments. For example, "people are always going to talk about what women wear on TV. It's a fact of life" said newsreader Suzanna Reid, in an interview printed in the BBC TV listings magazine, the Radio Times (quoted in Webb 2012[60]). Women tend to be judged and criticised for their fashion choices, if the outfit is considered as immodest or "sexually alluring" (Entwhistle 2000, p. 149)[61].

^[57] See table 12 - https://whomakesthenews.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/11/GMMP2020.ENG_.FINAL_.pdf
[58] ibid

^[59] Aulette, J. R., Wittner, J., & Blakely, K. (2009). *Gendered worlds*. New York: Oxford University Press [60] Webb, C. (2012), 'TV's superwoman', Radio Times, 17–23 March, p. 18.

^[61] Entwhistle, J. (2000). The fashioned body: Fashion, dress and modern social theory, Cambridge: Polity.

As demonstrated by Mitra et al. (2014)[62], women have to appear knowledgeable and dedicated to override the stereotypes linked to emphasised femininity.

Suggested exercise - video analysis

Group activity. Each group watches 3 TV news excerpts (1 interview, 1 political debate, 1 story) with a cis or trans female politician. Focus on the following points.

- How is the leader represented? Face/ body? Where were the cameras placed?
- How are the images edited?
- How many seconds/minutes are dedicated to direct speech?
- Are there any references to gendered topics (e.g module 2)?
- Are the interviewers/political opponents respectful?
- How is the leader framed?

Tips for trainers when reporting the findings

Focus on the following points:

- Were the questions appropriate?
 - If participants were just reading a transcript of the news story, would they know that the interviewee/debater/subject is a woman? Why?
 - If the selected politician is from a minority background, has their background been mentioned in an appropriate and justified way?
 - For transgender politicians, have they used the correct pronouns?
- Where was the camera placed? Would they be placed in the same position for a man?
- What could be improved?

Self-evaluation. Participants working on TV can criticise their own TV news stories or interviews and share their experience with the group.

- What kind of difficulties do they identify in their daily routine?
- What could they improve in their practice?

Suggested resources

Institutional resources

Portraying Politics, a toolkit on gender and television.

News values and priorities, the choice of language and images, and the overall journalistic framing of individuals and issues all come together in a complex process to produce particular representations of women and men in public life. This project aimed to intervene in that process, to make visible the media practices involved in it, and to promote critical reflection and change, which resulted in the development of the toolkit.

https://www.coe.int/t/dg4/cultureheritage/mars/source/resources/references/others/53%20-%20Portraying%20Politics%20-%202006%20COMP.pdf

Reaching Target 3 - Understand the specificities of tweets and other social media platforms news snippets.

Social media platforms, especially Twitter, are important distribution channels for news. These platforms can be considered as "arenas of experimenting with and challenging the existing text norms for journalistic stories" (Hagvar, 2019, p. 854) [63]. News is usually presented in the form of multimodal snippets, summarising news content accessible on the media outlet's website. These snippets combine characteristics from social media with characteristics of traditional media.

One of the specificities of the social media snippets deals with shareworthiness (Trilling et al., 2017)[64]. "Shareworthiness" echoes newsworthiness (see module 3). While the concept of newsworthiness suggests that some editorial content is perceived as more relevant than others (Galtung & Ruge, 1965[65]), shareworthiness suggests that some editorial content is more likely to be shared by users on social media.

[63] Hagvar, Y. B (2019), News media's rhetoric on Facebook, *Journalism practice*, 13(7), 853–872 [64] Trilling, D., Tolochko, P., & Burscher, B. (2017). From Newsworthiness to Shareworthiness: How to predict news sharing based on article characteristics. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*, 94(1), 38–60. [65] Galtung, J., & Ruge, M. H. (1965). The Structure of foreign News: The Presentation of the Congo, Cuba and Cyprus crises in four Norwegian newspapers. *Journal of Peace Research*, 2(1), 64–90.

Stories that evoke high-arousal emotions like joy or anger are more likely to be shared (Berger & Milkman, 2012[66]; Eberholst & Hartley, 2014[67]). Therefore, on social media, news snippets statistically contain more subjective words than the traditional headlines and leads do (Welbers & Opgenhaffen, 2019).

the Gender inequalities can be exacerbated by for shareworthiness. It is therefore important to pay attention to the existence of gender biases in social media snippets. Besides, research has shown that social media can be a highly toxic environment for women and trans people. Women disproportionately victims of online harassment and online hate speech (e.g. Henry & Powell 2015)[68], in the form of offensive sexual messages, or gender-humiliating comments stating that women should go back to their 'natural place, the kitchen' (Barak, 2005)[69].

Suggested exercise - Twitter analysis

Group analysis. Each group choses a different female leader and observes on Twitter, tweets published about this personality (at least group with a cisgender woman, a cisgender man, a transgender woman, a transgender man) and focuses on the following points:

- Is there a picture?
- How is the leader represented? Face portrait body/alone/in a group
- What is the person doing in the picture? Where are they?
- What is the facial expression? Is it flattering?
- How are pictures and text combined to give meaning? Is the picture adequate?
- What is the frame underpinning each tweet?
- Can you group these tweets by types of frames?

^[66] Berger, J., & Milkman, K. L. (2012). What makes online content viral?. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 49 (2), pp. 192–205. [67] Eberholst, M., & Hartley, J. (2014). Agency and civic involvement in news production via Facebook commentary. Paper presented at ECREA 2014, Lisboa, Portugal..

^[68] Henry, N., & Powell, P. (2015), Embodied harms: Gender, shame, and technology-facilitated sexual violence. *Violence Against Women*, 21 (6), 758–79

Cross-check. Groups will be mixed and will compare their results and focus on the following points:

- Do you observe some gender patterns?
- Are cis/trangender/female/male all reported in the same way?
- What about politicians with an intersectional background?

Tips for trainers when reporting the findings

Focus on the following aspects:

- Do participants use more emotional language on Twitter?
- Do participants publish more gendered soft news on Twitter?
- Could pictures selected for Twitter be published in printed newspapers?
- Can participants observe a pattern of violence on Twitter?

Individual Twitter analysis

Participants will retrieve their own tweets:

- Do you observe some gender patterns?
- Are cis/trangender/female/male all reported in the same way?
- What can you improve?
- Are the online patterns observed similar to the patterns observed offline? Compare with your worksheet for module 4.

Tips for trainers when reporting the findings

Focus on:

- Specific online patterns and compare them to offline patterns.
- Harassment/cyberbullying on Twitter and on other social media platforms.

Suggested resources.

AGEMI training

Unit 8 - <u>Gendered dimensions of technological innovation in journalism</u> - In this unit, we will gain a better understanding of the gender-technology relationship in journalism, drawing on insights from feminist media studies, journalism studies and feminist technology studies to provide a theoretical background.

We will look at gendered obstacles in relation to technological innovation in journalism as well as the empowering potential of technology. More specifically, we will focus on the importance and gendering of digital skills, gender issues in data journalism, and opportunities for empowerment of women through technology.

Related students' project/s

- The fascination of men vs the weariness of women. Perception of leaders during Covid-19. This project focuses on how social media users appraised, through comments, the TV interventions of their political leaders during the Covid-19 pandemic. It focuses on four politicians: Giuseppe Conte (Italy); Pedro Sanchez (Spain); Mette Frederiksen (Denmark); Sophie Wilmes (Belgium). It shows substantial differences depending on the gender of the political figure. While social media users tended to idolise their male leaders, they were weary and critical of female leaders.
- <u>Behind social media</u> focuses on the difficulties that political women face in their social networks, such as discrimination, violence, harassment, cyberbullying, etc.
- <u>Setting the narrative: How women in power use social media to spread their message.</u> This project investigates how the Italian Prime Minister Giorgia Meloni and US MP Alexandra Ocasio-Cortez use social media to communicate their ideas and exchange with their followers.

Other sources

Dehingia, N. (2020). When social media is sexist: A call to action against online gender-based violence. https://gehweb.ucsd.edu/social-media-sexist-online-gender-based-violence/

Quodling, D. (2014). Abuse of women on Twitter: Not a quick fix but that's no excuse https://theconversation.com/abuse-of-women-on-twitter-no-quick-fix-but-thats-no-excuse-33943

Module 6 - Methodology - Getting ready to be a trainer

This last module is dedicated to preparing the trainer to be able to deliver effective training courses. It is structured slightly differently and focuses on the competencies trainers must master before they run their own training.

As mentioned in the introduction of this toolkit, trainers must be able to train their peers in their respective countries. Such a task requires five main competencies:

- 1- Have a clear understanding of their teaching goals;
- 2- Mastering the concepts acquired during the ToT;
- 3-Being aware of existing resources and reference materials;
- 4- Leading activities that reinforce learning;
- 5- Responding to participants' questions.

Other general competencies also include the importance of maintaining eye contact, presenting a positive attitude, speaking in a clear voice, gesturing appropriately, and maintaining interest and dissipating confusion.

The AGEMI platform has a new <u>dedicated section</u>, which includes a <u>'Training for journalists'</u> unit hosting all material relevant, which can be used as a space to carry out national and future workshops. Anyone interested in holding a training with and for journalists on the topic can openly access the AGEMI platform and make use of all available materials. Moreover, should trainers wish to make use of the Moodle-type functions (learning and interactive platform), they can contact AGEMI team (<u>luciaglv@ucm.es</u>) and be assigned an "instructor" role.

Module 6 - Methodology - Getting ready to be a trainer

This last module is dedicated to preparing the trainer to be able to deliver effective training courses. It is structured slightly differently and focuses on the competencies trainers must master before they run their own training.

As mentioned in the introduction of this toolkit, trainers must be able to train their peers in their respective countries. Such a task requires five main competencies:

- 1- Have a clear understanding of their teaching goals;
- 2- Mastering the concepts acquired during the ToT;
- 3-Being aware of existing resources and reference materials;
- 4- Leading activities that reinforce learning;
- 5-Responding to participants' questions.

Other general competencies also include the importance of maintaining eye contact, presenting a positive attitude, speaking in a clear voice, gesturing appropriately, and maintaining interest and dissipating confusion.

The AGEMI platform has a new section named "Training for journalists" that hosts all the materials relevant for the 'Rewriting the story. Gender, Media and Politics' project. This includes a dedicated Moodle space (learning and interactive platform) that can be used to carry out and/or support further thematic training, including the national workshops that will be conducted in each of the countries that participate in this project. The theoretical content, learning activities and relevant examples are all free to access and only require the participants (instructors and trainees) to sign up using their email accounts and setting up a password. As such, anyone interested in organizing and carrying out a training with and for journalists on the topic can openly access the AGEMI platform and make use of all available materials.

Moreover, should trainers wish to make use of the Moodle-related functions, they can contact the AGEMI team (luciaglv@ucm.es) and will be assigned an instructor role to access other options, such as assigning tasks or creating forums for discussion.

<u>Mastering competency 1 - Having a clear understanding of the training targets</u>

Module 1 focused on raising awareness in order to turn deniers and bystanders into confronters, who would take a proactive approach and confront gender biases in the media representation of cisgender and transgender female leaders in politics, and in society in general. Module 2 to 5 provided the necessary tools to confront these gender biases at each stage of the creation of a news story.

However, becoming an active confronter doesn't necessarily mean using neutral discourse. According to epistemologist Sandra Harding (1995)[70], the idea of discourse neutrality is not an achievable goal. Language and discourse will always be impacted by the surrounding social-cultural context. However, journalists can avoid using some unwanted gendered stereotypes by being aware of their own subjective socio-cultural standpoint. This is what Harding (1995) calls "strong objectivity".

The trainers' main goal is therefore to provide participants with the necessary tools to develop a sense of "strong objectivity". The fifteen module targets will help them reach this ultimate goal. A list of the training targets is provided in Annexe 1.

Get ready for the national training:

- Make sure that your national training program includes all the training targets with adequate exercises (use Annexe 1 checklist);
- Prepare to explain the concept of "strong objectivity" in simple words to the participants.
- Be prepared to face some deniers who may not agree with what you say.

<u>Mastering competency 2 - Mastering the key concepts acquired</u> <u>during the ToT</u>

Each module contains a list of key theoretical concepts. These are defined in the toolkit. For trainers, who want to investigate these key concepts, a list of additional resources is provided for each pedagogical target.

Get ready for the national training:

- Make sure you are comfortable with the concepts studied during the ToT. You can use the glossary to revise the concepts (see Annexe 2);
- Prepare to translate the concepts studied into your national language;
- Try to answer the questions mentioned in the suggested exercises to check your knowledge.

<u>Mastering competency 3 - Being aware of existing resources and</u> <u>reference materials</u>

For each module, there is a list of references that can be used. They will provide additional information regarding topics or concepts contained in the module. Some of them can be mentioned to the participants during training, if relevant.

Get ready for the national training:

- Check the students presentations to get a fresh perspective on the topic studied;
- Consult the suggested resources if you need to complete your knowledge;
- Make sure that you are able to mention some national initiatives, if they exist. Use the AGEMI Resource Bank to find some.

Mastering competency 4 - Leading activities that reinforce learning

Modules 2 to 5 have been designed with a mix of theory and practical exercises in order to build a reflex of "strong objectivity". While digging in to their own news production, participants will hopefully develop a strong sense of their own subjective socio-cultural standpoint. Such a perception will help them adapt their discourse and language choices in order to limit gender biases.

Get ready for the national training:

- Adapt the activities to the national context and to the audience.
 Select as examples to study during the training a variety of news stories that include cisgender/trangender female and male figures. Don't forget to include intersectional profiles.
- Ask the participants to come with a portfolio of news stories.
- Don't hesitate to use interactive tools to increase participation such as <u>Mentimeter</u> for surveys, <u>Kahoot</u> for quizzes or <u>Padlet</u> to create an interactive whiteboard
- Use Annexe 3 to prepare your training programme.

Mastering competency 5 - Responding to participants' questions

During the ToT, a group of rapporteurs will prepare a series of questions that anticipate what participants may ask during the national training. These will be collected and answered collectively in Module 6. A copy of these questions will be added to the tool kit.

Get ready for the national training:

- Don't hesitate to ask questions during the ToT;
- Check the list of questions and answers before the national training;
- Revise some specific points if you have a doubt.

Suggested exercise - Role play

Put yourself in the shoes of... - In groups of eight, participants will assume the following roles:

- Three participants will be journalists
- One participant will be a political figure
- Two participants will be observers. They will observe the interviews, take notes and comment on the findings.
- Two participants will be trainers. They will observe the interviews and conduct the reporting.

The politician role-player will select at random four characteristics from the Wheel of power/privilege (eyes closed) and prepare four pieces of paper (two with the intersectional characteristics right, one with the intersectional characteristics wrong, and one blank). The pieces of paper are distributed to the three journalists, and one of the pieces with the right information will be distributed to the trainers. The role players must keep the content of their piece of paper secret. All three journalists will interview, one after another, the politician role-player (3 minutes each). The observers will take notes and observe the differences between the interviews.

At the end of the interviews, journalists and observers will share their impressions of the journalists' interviews, and draw some conclusions. They should focus on the following points:

- Who did the more/less gendered neutral interview?
- Could observers perceive a difference in the set of questions? In the attitude of the interviewer?
- Can participants define the intersectional characteristics of the political figure?

The trainers will evaluate the work of their role-playing group, provide guidance, and ask some questions when necessary.

Annexe 1 - Training targets

Module	Target	Ready
1	Raise awareness regarding the representation of women in politics	
	Elaborate a comprehensive definition of gender equality in the news	
	List the different factors that impact gender equality in the media	
2	Elaborate a comprehensive definition of gender equal newsworthiness	
	Identify some stereotypical topics considered as newsworthy when portraying women (cis & trans)	
	Understand the importance of applying the "rule of reversibility" when selecting some editorial content or when conducting an interview	
3	Uncover and analyse frames contained in news stories	
	Understand the 'double bind' dilemma created by a cisgender masculine framing of leadership	
	Eliminate gendered frames from your news stories.	
4	Detect subtle forms of gendered discourse often hidden in a news story using Critical Discourse Analysis	
	Debunk one's gendered writing automatisms	
	Replace deeply ingrained gendered writing habits by gender neutral writing habits	
5	Understand the rules of visual design and multimodal composition in news photographs	
	Eliminate gender biases from video broadcasting	
	Understand the specificities of tweets and other social media platforms news snippets	

Annexe 2 - Glossary

Agenda setting. Role played by the media in amplifying certain issues, increasing their salience within the public sphere and constructing parameters within which debate will be seen as legitimate (Harcup, 2014)

Body-ism. (Hall & Crum, 1994[71]) Echoes the concept of face-ism and refers to the body prominence of subjects in pictures. Higher "body-ism" indexes for women reinforces the stereotypical images of women as decoration for men or sex objects, while the higher face-ism of pictures portraying men might result in greater perception of competence, authority, credibility, dominance, and control (characteristics associated with masculinity (Bretl & Cantor, 1988)[72].

Cisgender. Person identifying with the sex assigned to them at birth.

Critical Discourse Analysis. "Social scientific theory and method for analysing and critiquing the use of language and its contribution to forming and sustaining social practice and for analysis of how language can contribute to reproducing or transforming social problems." (Farelli, 2019)[73]

Double-bind. A situation in which a person must choose between equally unsatisfactory alternatives (Catalyst, 2007)

Episodic framing/ thematic framing. Episodic frame focuses on the singularity of an event, while thematic framing focuses on trends over time.

^[71] Hall, C., Crum, M. (1994). Women and "body-isms" in television beer commercials. *Sex Roles*. 31 (5–6), 329–337. [72] Bretl, D., & Cantor, J. (1988). The portrayal of men and women in U.S. television commercials: A recent content analysis and trends over 15 years. *Sex Roles*, 18, 595-609.

^[73] Farrelly, M., (2019). Critical Discourse Analysis, In P. Atkinson, S. Delamont, A. Cernat, J.W. Sakshaug, & R.A. Williams (Eds.), SAGE Research Methods Foundations.

Face-ism. (Archer et al., 1983)[74] refers to the facial prominence of subjects in pictures, measured by a face-ism index, defined as the distance from the top of the head to the lowest point of the chin divided by the distance from the top of the head to the lowest visible part of the subject's body. Men tend to have higher face-to-body ratios than women, as confirmed by the following literature (Nigro et al., 1988[75]; Copeland, 1989[76]). Photographs with high face prominence generate more positive ratings in terms of intelligence, ambition and physical appearance than those with low face prominence.

Framing. Framing refers to the process of assembling some elements such as keywords, images, or sentences in a specific way, in order to create a narrative (also called a 'frame') that promotes a particular interpretation of a situation or a story. According to sociologist Robert Enman (1993)[77], the frames perform four functions: 1/ they define problems, 2/ they diagnose causes for the defined problems, 3/ they make a moral judgement and evaluate causal agents and their effects, and 4/ they promote a remedy, that is to propose and justify treatments for the diagnosed problems. In doing so, frames shape the audience's inherent interpretations, activating schemes that encourage target audiences to think, feel, and decide in a particular way.

Frame setting vs. frame sending. When framing news stories, they can either "pass on interpretations provided by other actors" - what Brüggemann (2014, p.62[78]) calls "frame sending" - or they can provide their own individual interpretations of a situation based on their socio-cultural values, that is "frame setting" in opposition to frame sending. News stories are usually a mixture of both, considering the collective culture within a newsroom and the collaboration between journalists and sources.

[74] Archer, D., Iritani, B., Kimes, D., & Barrios, M. (1983). Face-ism: Five studies of sex differences in facial prominence. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*. 45 (4), 725–735.

^[75]Nigro, G., Hill, D., Gelbein, M.; Clark, C. (1988). Changes in the facial prominence of women and men over the last decade. *Psychology of Women Quarterly.* 12 (2), 225–235.

^[76]Copeland, G. (1989). Face-ism and primetime television. Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media. 33 (2), 209–214. [77] Entman, R.M. (1993), Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of Communication*, 43, 51-58. [78] Bruggemann, M. (2014). Between frame setting and frame sending: How journalists contribute to news frames. *Communication Theory*, 24(1), 61–82.

Gender. "Social attributes and opportunities associated with being female and male and to the relationships between women and men and girls and boys, as well as to the relations between women and those between men" (EIGE glossary)[79].

Gender-based violence. Violence directed against a person because of that person's gender, gender identity or gender expression, or which affects persons of a particular gender disproportionately. Gender-based violence and violence against women are terms that are often used interchangeably as it has been widely acknowledged that most gender-based violence is inflicted on women and girls, by men. However, using the 'gender-based' aspect is important as it highlights the fact that many forms of violence against women are rooted in power inequalities between women and men.[80]

Gender equality. Equal rights, responsibilities and opportunities of women and men and girls and boys. Equality does not mean that women and men will become the same but that women's and men's rights, responsibilities and opportunities will not depend on whether they are born male or female. Gender equality implies that the interests, needs and priorities of both women and men are taken into consideration, recognizing the diversity of different groups of women and men. Gender equality is not a women's issue but should concern and fully engage men as well as women. Equality between women and men is seen both as a human rights issue and as a precondition for, and indicator of, sustainable people-centred development." (EIGE glossary)[81]

Intertextuality. Existence of connections between media messages. A media message is interpreted using other existing media messages, by means of its implicit or explicit allusions.

Intersectionality. Term originally coined by Kimberlé Crenshaw (1989) [82], intersectionality is "a way of thinking about identity and its relationship to power." (Crenshaw, 2015)[83]. "Intersectionality is an analytical tool for studying, understanding and responding to the ways in which gender intersects with other identities and how these intersections contribute to unique experiences of oppression and privilege." [84]

For a graphic representation of intersectionality, check CRIAW-ICREF's intersectionality wheel.

Multimodality. Interplay between different representational modes, for instance, between images and written/spoken words in order to generate meaning.

Newsworthiness. "The extent to which some event, occurrence, statement, or observation has the potential to become news." (Harcup, 2014)

Patriarchy. "Traditional form of organizing society which often lies at the root of gender inequality. According to this kind of social system, men, or what is considered masculine, is accorded more importance than women, or what is considered feminine. Traditionally, societies have been organized in such a way that property, residence and descent, as well as decision-making regarding most areas of life, have been the domain of men. This is often based on appeals to biological reasoning (women are more naturally suited to be caregivers, for example) and continues to underlie many kinds of gender discrimination" (UNwomen Glossary)

Non-sexist use of language. Avoidance of both an ambiguous generic masculine gender in the grammatical forms of nouns and discriminatory expressions which describe women and men in terms of their physical appearance or the qualities and gender roles attributed to their sex. (EIGE Glossary)

[82] Crenshaw, K. (1989). Demarginalizing the intersection of race and sex: A Black feminist critique of antidiscrimination doctrine, feminist theory and antiracist politics. *The University of Chicago Legal Forum*, 140, 139-167.

[83] Crenshaw, K. (2015, Sept. 24). Opinion - Why intersectionality can't wait. *The New York Times*.

https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/in-theory/wp/2015/09/24/why-intersectionality-cant-wait/

[84] Association for Women's Rights in Development (AWID) (2004). *Intersectionality: A Tool for Gender and Economic Justice* http://www.intergroupresources.com/rc/Intersectionality%20-%20a%20Tool%20Gender%20&%20Economic%20Justice.pdf

Transgender. Person who has a gender identity different to the gender assigned at birth and who wishes to portray gender identity in a different way to the gender assigned at birth.(EIGE Glossary)

Sex. "Biological and physiological characteristics that define humans as female or male. These sets of biological characteristics are not mutually exclusive, as there are individuals who possess both, but these characteristics tend to differentiate humans as females or males." (EIGE Glossary)

Annexe 3 - Suggested training schedule

Day 1

Morning	Module 1 (75 min) - Raise awareness regarding the representation of women in politics - Elaborate a comprehensive definition of gender equality in the news - List the different factors that impact gender equality in the media
	Module 2 (135 min) - Elaborate a comprehensive definition of gender equal newsworthiness - Identify some stereotypical topics considered as newsworthy when portraying women (cis & trans) - Understand the importance of applying the "rule of reversibility" when selecting some editorial content or when conducting an interview
Afternoon	Module 3 (210 min)

Day 2

Morning	Module 4 (210 min) Detect subtle forms of gendered discourse often hidden in news story using Critical Discourse Analysis Debunk one's gendered writing automatisms Replace deeply ingrained gendered writing habits by gender neutral writing habits
Afternoon	Module 5 (210 min) - Understand the rules of visual design and multimodal composition in news photographs - Eliminate gender biases from video broadcasting - Understand the specificities of tweets and other social media platforms news snippets